

# **EDMONDS CITY COUNCIL APPROVED MINUTES**

## **July 21, 2015**

The Edmonds City Council special meeting was called to order at 6:01 p.m. by Mayor Earling in the Council Chambers, 250 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue North, Edmonds.

### **ELECTED OFFICIALS PRESENT**

Dave Earling, Mayor  
Adrienne Fraley-Monillas, Council President  
Diane Buckshnis, Councilmember  
Kristiana Johnson, Councilmember (arrived 6:07 p.m.)  
Lora Petso, Councilmember  
Joan Bloom, Councilmember (arrived 6:05 p.m.)  
Thomas Mesaros, Councilmember  
Michael Nelson, Councilmember

### **STAFF PRESENT**

Phil Williams, Public Works Director  
Carrie Hite, Parks, Rec. & Cult. Serv. Dir.  
Shane Hope, Development Services Director  
Scott James, Finance Director  
Rob Chave, Planning Manager  
Renee McRae, Recreation Manager  
Rob English, City Engineer  
Bertrand Hauss, Transportation Engineer  
Jeff Taraday, City Attorney  
Scott Passey, City Clerk  
Jerrie Bevington, Camera Operator  
Jeannie Dines, Recorder

### **SPECIAL MEETING**

#### **1. JOINT MEETING WITH SNOHOMISH COUNTY FIRE DISTRICT 1 BOARD**

Fire District 1 Commissioners present: Jim Kenney (Chair), David Chan, Jim McGaughey, Bob Meador, and Richard Schrock.

Fire District 1 staff present: Ed Widdis, Fire Chief; Doug Dahl, Deputy Chief; Brad Reading, Assistant Chief; Bob Eastman, Assistant Chief; Leslie Hynes, Public Information Officer; Shane Cooper, Community Paramedic; and Lisa Scrivens, Executive Assistant to the Board of Fire Commissioners.

Fire District 1 Board Chair Kenney introduced the Commissioners. He also called to order the special meeting for the Fire District 1 Board of Commissioners.

Chief Widdis presented the FD1 2014 Annual Report to the City of Edmonds. He provided highlights from the report regarding leadership and emergency response, and the upgrade in the fire rating from 4 to 3 which may lower insurance fees. He provided information regarding the Oso mudslide, advising crews spent nearly a month at the site.

Assistant Chief Bob Eastman introduced Community Paramedic Shane Cooper and provided copies of FD1's report to Verdant regarding the first 12 months of the program. He explained the Community Paramedic Program continues to impact the community. FD1 receives daily referrals, 1/3 of the citizens who call have been looking for help for at least 6 months, indicating the value of the program to the citizens within FD1 which includes contract cities. He highlighted the addition of Shift MSOs (medical supervisors) 24/7, the first district in Snohomish County to do so which continues to improve service delivery in FD1. With the Community Paramedic Program, they found the top injury response is falls; 1,002 cases in 2014. FD1 has hired a falls CPR and ASCERT specialist who starts Monday who will

concentrate on falls prevention with a target of reducing the number of fall responses. Cardiac arrest data found very few people in FD1 get bystander CPR and last year no one used the automated external defibrillators (AED). That will be one of this person educational points in the community; to improve that statistic.

Councilmember Mesaros referred to the statistics in the report regarding top 10 EMS responses, which were in excess of 1,000 falls. Assistant Chief Eastman said the national fall mortality average is 50%. As falls use a great deal of hospital resources, fall prevention is being targeted across the U.S.

Councilmember Nelson asked whether the non-use of AED's was an issue of proximity or access. He also asked how many AEDs there are in the community. Assistant Chief Eastman responded it is a combination of both. He did not know the number of AED's currently deployed in FD1. Heart screenings in schools was triggered by an event at a high school where there was an AED available but no one went to get it. The District is looking at several ways to address that; one way is to identify where the AEDs are located so the dispatcher can tell the caller whether there is an AED at the location. Another way is to place more AEDs in the community.

Council President Fraley-Monillas asked whether the price of AEDs was decreasing. Assistant Chief Eastman answered not significantly; personal AEDs cost approximately \$500-\$800. One of the challenges with providing public access to AEDs is theft; they cannot be locked because the public needs to have access. Agencies that have AEDs are considering putting them in monitored boxes or putting an alarm on the box that alerts dispatch but there are associated costs.

Assistant Chief Eastman reported the 2014 cardiac survival rate in FD1's service area was a 71.4%. which is the typical survival rate used by King County Medic 1 with bystander initiated CPR, use of an AED, etc. FD1's survival rate is the highest in the county and among the highest nationally. He reported the Bike Medic Program with teams of two bike medics is reinstated in 2015 and will be seen at events this summer such as Taste of Edmonds.

FD1 is engaged nationally and at the state level with regard to EMS issues. Captain Shaughn Maxwell was invited to stand on a federally funded committee regarding EMS performance nationally. The last time the federal government did that was 1969. FD1 is privileged to have a staff member sitting on that committee, one of two fire based practitioners participating on the committee. He reported FD1 received two awards in 2014. Captain Maxwell received one of the top ten emergency innovators in emergency medical services, a nationally recognized award from Journal of Emergency Medical Services. Community Paramedic Cooper was honored at the Red Cross breakfast as the recipient of the Spirit Red Cross Award, recognizing his outstanding work in FD1's community paramedic program.

Assistant Chief Eastman reported ongoing training keeps firefighters and paramedics compliant with standards of the WACs with regard to training. He referred to a list of training topics in the report including training of 22 newly hired firefighters, emergency driver training, mass casualty incident, ladder truck training, and command staff training. FD1 participates in the countywide annual training program as well as quarterly drills. One of the quarterly drills in 2014 was railroad response training. Countywide training regarding railroad response was done last year; that was expanded this year to include command staff, law enforcement and BNSF from a tabletop perspective.

Councilmember Buckshnis asked whether that training was emergency response related to a disaster or getting to the west side of the tracks. Assistant Chief Eastman answered both; the 2014 ASCERT training was related to an event. The training this year was how to reach the other side and associated planning.

Councilmember Nelson asked how often that training occurs. Assistant Chief Eastman answered FD1 has four annual regional drills, ASCERT training. Regional train response training was done last year; train

response training was done this year with command staff. FD1 frequently looks at train response. Councilmember Nelson asked if the table top was a scenario. Deputy Chief of Operations Doug Dahl explained that training, which the Edmonds Police Department participated in, was a simulated event, an oil train derailling at the ferry dock, exploding, multiple fires, and both crossings blocked. Councilmember Nelson asked what they learned. Deputy Chief Dahl said they learned it would be intensive and require a lot of resources which are available via all hazards mobilization that was recently passed. FD1 has always had a plan to get across the tracks that includes assistance from the Port, going through train where possible; they have not determined a way to get a fire engine or ladder truck on the other side. He summarized it will be a manpower intensive, multi-day event but resources show FD1 can handle the response.

Chief Widdis highlighted prevention and education including inspections and permits issued in Edmonds, number of people trained in CPR, car seat checks, and a CPR flash mob at the Edmonds-Woodway High School. He commented on community connections including the parade, speaking at the Edmonds Senior Center, Sister City tours, Waterfront Festival, National Night Out, and Tree Lighting. He described the use of volunteers and with the dissolution of ESCA, working with Department of Emergency Management to retain ESCA volunteers.

Chief Widdis commented on the hiring of 22 new firefighters who will fill vacancies that occurred during the recession that were not filled as well as assist with staffing the peak activity unit, a transport unit available 12 hours/day to address daytime peaks, which is less expensive than a 24 hour car.

Chief Widdis referred to funding sources in the annual report and the clean audit FD1 received from the State. He commented on mutual aid responses such as when other agencies assisted FD1 with a brush fire in north FD1 and FD1's technical rescue unit responding to the ice caves incident as well as sending units to cover Marysville and Lake Stevens stations while they responded.

Deputy Chief Doug Dahl reviewed the Compliance Report based on standards the City Council adopted in 2009 as required by SHB 1756:

- Response by call type
  - Emergency Medical Services: 82%
  - Service Call: 4%
  - False Alarm: 4%
  - Fire: 2%
  - Good Intent: 6%
  - Hazardous Conditions: 2%
  - Other: 0%
- Total incidents in the City
  - 2012: 4,576
  - 2013: 4,804
  - 2014: 4,718
- Total incidents by Edmonds stations
  - Station 16:
    - 2011: 1,345
    - 2012: 1,346
    - 2013: 1,435
    - 2014: 1,328
  - Station 17:
    - 2011: 1,650
    - 2012: 1,539
    - 2013: 1,634
    - 2014: 1,486

- Station 20:
  - 2011: 1,954
  - 2012: 1,935
  - 2013: 1,973
  - 2014: 2,042
- Graph of all FD1 calls by time of day
  - Call volumes peak during the day and drop off at night in FD1's service area
- Total response time: Better than standard
  - Standard: 8:00 minutes
  - Actual 2014: 7:56 minutes
- Total turnout time: Better than standard
  - Standard: 2:45 minutes
  - Actual 2014: 2:36 minutes
- Basic Life Support (BLS response): Better than standard
  - Standard: 5:15 minutes
  - Actual 2014: 5:13 minutes
- Advanced Life Support (ALS) paramedic response: Better than standard
  - Standard: 6:45 minutes
  - Actual 2014: 6:01 minutes

Council President Fraley-Monillas asked where ALS units were traveling from. Deputy Chief Dahl answered the 2-person Medic 17 unit is based at Station 17 in downtown Edmonds. A single medic unit is based at Station 20 when staffing allows. Council President Fraley-Monillas asked whether the 6:45 minute response would potentially be to the furthest point in Edmonds. Deputy Chief Dahl said it could be, it represents 90% of the calls in Edmonds.

Councilmember Nelson asked why the ALS response time exceeds the standard by such a large margin. Assistant Chief Eastman said the actual in 2013 was 6:15 minutes which also exceeded standard.

Councilmember Buckshnis asked for confirmation that Edmonds pay for 24 hour ALS. Deputy Chief Dahl answered yes, explaining the predominant number of ALS calls in Edmonds are in the bowl area.

Deputy Chief Dahl continued his review:

- First arriving fire engine on fire response: Does not meet standard
  - Standard: 6:30 minutes
  - Actual 2014: 6:51 minutes
    - City of Edmonds has never met this standard

Councilmember Mesaros asked what factors FD1 is looking at for improvement such as a new fire station. Deputy Chief Dahl answered new technology may help with that; New World is set to launch October 27. Currently on a busy day, the time between when a unit says they are responding and when dispatch has time to push the button can vary 20 seconds. That will be automatically recorded with New World which will improve response time numbers. As a whole, FD1 is experiencing increased call loads; as call loads increase with the same amount of force, there is potential for a decrease in response time as backup units are out of service more often. He referred to information in Appendix B that lists ways to improve; the issue of new stations arises when the standard is not met.

- Residential fire response assembly of effective force: Does not meet standard
  - Standard: 7:45 minutes
  - Actual Incident 1: 5:00 minutes
  - Actual Incident 2: 5:00 minutes
  - Actual Incident 3: 7:43 minutes

- Actual Incident 4: 8:00 minutes
- Actual Incident 5: 8:01 minutes
- Often relying on neighboring fire departments to arrive
- Commercial fire response assembly of effective force (1 call): Better than standard
  - Standard: 9:00 minutes
  - Actual 2014: 7:00 minutes
- Technical rescue and hazardous materials response: No incidents reported
- Response time for marine rescue and personnel: Better than standard
  - Standard: 6:30 minutes
  - Actual 2014: 5:57 minutes

Noting there is a 15-20% increase in the population every 4 years, Mayor Earling asked how the public is informed about the availability of the Community Paramedic Program. Chief Widdis explained FD1 receives referrals through the system. There have been newspaper articles and press releases but they are overwhelmed with just one community paramedic and do not have an opportunity to see all the patients that are referred. FD1's Verdant grant for the program runs through the end of 2015; they may seek additional funding to expand the program to two community paramedics. Lynnwood Fire Department has a similar program with a mental health professional. FD1 is working with Lynnwood to expand the program.

Councilmember Buckshnis expressed appreciation for the 2014 Annual Report including the addition of funding sources. She suggested next year's report include the 2015 actual and 2016 budget.

Councilmember Mesaros asked the total FD1 FTE and what percentage the 22 new hires represents. Chief Widdis answered FD1 has almost 200 firefighters, slightly more with office staff. During the recession, vacancies created by retirements were left vacant to avoid layoffs. Half the 22 positions were to fill vacant positions, the other half were to staff the peak activity unit. A lot of the new hires were laterals from other fire departments who were already trained/certified. He explained they are continually looking at hiring as approximately 1/3 of the workforce is over 53. They are working with the Office of Military families and veterans groups as well as trying to enhance diversity. There is a price tag associated with sending new hires to the fire academy and then to paramedic school.

Councilmember Nelson asked whether data was available to show how the community paramedic has impacted call loads. Chief Widdis said that is included in FD1's report to Verdant. He explained 500 calls/year are generated by 50 people. The community paramedic works to get resources to people instead of calling 911. The program has cut that number by 50% by providing them resources. Community Paramedic Cooper is also working with the homeless and was at Oso giving vaccines to the military.

Mayor Earling relayed Edmonds was successful in obtaining funds from the State during the legislative session to take a thorough look at the at-grade crossing problem. An advisory group is being formed; he suggested FD1 participate in meetings where their expertise would be of assistance. Chief Widdis said FD1 would be happy to participate, commenting that was one advantage of Fire Marshal Westfall in City Hall and other staff is available as needed.

Fire Commission Chair Kenny relayed three issues from the Board:

1. On approximately January 27, 2015 the City and District agreed to an amendment to the Interlocal Agreement (ILA) for fire service and EMS. The amendment called for the District and the City to meet to discuss options for changes to the ILA. One meeting was held in March; but FD1 has been unable to get the City to agree to another meeting. He understood the City had hired a fire service consultant, Fitch & Associates. He relayed the District's hope that negotiation dates could be established in the near future.

2. Chief Widdis has announced his retirement at the end of 2016. The Board thanks Chief Widdis for his service to the District and City. The Board will be working on a hiring process and will keep the City updated.
3. In an effort to improve communication with the City beyond annual meeting, a deputy chief will be a liaison to the City, regularly attend City Council meetings and provide brief fire service updates. The Board hopes this will provide another avenue for communication between the City and District. Mayor Earling expressed his appreciation for that effort.

Councilmember Mesaros thanked Commissioners for coming and Chief Widdis and his staff for the report, noting the importance of the Council being up-to-speed on how well FD1 is serving the City. He was pleased with the work FD1 is doing.

Mayor Earling commented on Chief Widdis' impending retirement, noting from his perspective, the City has always had open communication with Chief Widdis which he appreciated. He is always open to questions and providing information. He thanked Chief Widdis for his service.

The special meeting was adjourned at 6:47 p.m.

### **BUSINESS MEETING**

The Edmonds City Council business meeting was called to order at 7:00 p.m. by Mayor Earling in the Council Chambers, 250 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue North, Edmonds. The meeting was opened with the flag salute.

#### **2. ROLL CALL**

City Clerk Scott Passey called the roll. All elected officials were present.

#### **3. APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

**COUNCIL PRESIDENT FRALEY-MONILLAS MOVED, SECONDED BY COUNCILMEMBER BUCKSHNIS, TO APPROVE THE AGENDA IN CONTENT AND ORDER, MOVING ITEM 4 TO ITEM 6A. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

#### **5. APPROVAL OF CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS**

**COUNCILMEMBER BUCKSHNIS MOVED, SECONDED BY COUNCIL PRESIDENT FRALEY-MONILLAS, TO APPROVE THE CONSENT AGENDA. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY. The agenda items approved are as follows:**

- A. **APPROVAL OF DRAFT CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES OF JULY 14, 2015**
- B. **APPROVAL OF CLAIM CHECKS #215169 THROUGH #215302 DATED JULY 16, 2015 FOR \$572,131.53. APPROVAL OF PAYROLL CHECKS #61692 THROUGH #61700 FOR \$3,143.74, PAYROLL DIRECT DEPOSIT AND CHECKS #61701 THROUGH #61714 FOR \$500,752.31, BENEFIT CHECKS #61715 THROUGH #61720 AND WIRE PAYMENTS OF \$527,666.33 FOR THE PAY PERIOD JULY 1, 2015 THROUGH JULY 15, 2015**
- C. **RESOLUTION ACCEPTING AND ADOPTING THE HEARING EXAMINER'S RECOMMENDATIONS AND FINDINGS REGARDING THE PROPOSED SEPTEMBER 11<sup>TH</sup> MEMORIAL (PLN20150017)**
- D. **UPDATE CITY'S INVESTMENT POLICY**

**E. AUTHORIZATION FOR MAYOR TO SIGN A SUPPLEMENTAL AGREEMENT WITH PERTEET FOR THE 228TH ST. SW CORRIDOR PROJECT**

**6. SNOHOMISH HEALTH DISTRICT PRESENTATION**

Mayor Earling introduced Dr. Gary Goldbaum, Health Officer and Director of the Snohomish Health District. Dr. Goldbaum thanked Council President Fraley-Monillas, an active supporter of the Health District who serves on the Board of Health, for her service. He described what a public health does:

- Best Defense
  - Communicable disease surveillance and outreach
  - Vaccination education and quality control
  - High risk testing and referrals for care
  - Being Edmonds' best defense
    - Partnered with Verdant on a pertussis clinic and health expo
    - Medical Reserve Corps volunteers conducted health screenings and vaccine clinics at local health fairs
- Peace of Mind
  - Food safety
  - Water and wastewater
  - Solid waste and toxins
  - School safety
  - Being Edmonds Peace of Mind
    - 425 permitted and inspected restaurants, grocery stores, expresso stands, caterers and mobile food vehicles
    - 76 complaints addressed since January 2015
    - 118 permitted pools and spas that are inspected
    - 59 safety inspections conducted at public and private schools
    - Secure medicine disposal
    - Innovative partnership with local law enforcement Snohomish Health District and Snohomish County, aimed at addressing environmental concerns, preventing poisonings and deaths, reducing availability to teens
- Healthy Start
  - WIC and First Steps
  - Preventing Adverse Childhood Experiences (ACEs)
  - Refugee Health
  - 2,059 First Step clients served in 2014 at a South County location
  - Nutrition and parenting classes provided to pregnant women and new families
  - Hygiene kits given to refugee families just starting out in community
- First Responder
  - SR 530 slide response/Medical Reserve response
    - 44 staff members involved onsite and behind scenes
    - 1,178 hours of support time from Medical Reserve Corps volunteers
  - Measles exposure at Disneyland
    - 100 hours spent investigating potential measles exposure
    - 45 people tested for immunity to measles virus
    - 80 combined days of work missed by restricted employees
- Coach
  - Listen (assessment)
    - Community Health Assessment
    - Heroin Report
  - Guide (action)
    - Community Health Improvement Plan

- Identified three priority areas: youth physical abuse, suicide and obesity
  - Naloxone kits (reverses effects of opioids)
    - Law enforcement and first responders encouraged to carry kits
- Being Edmonds' coach
  - Walkability audits of all elementary schools
  - Expanding the 5210 program into local schools and transit
- Advocate
  - Improve built environment
  - Legislative issues
  - Funding

Dr. Goldbaum reported on the Health District's efforts related to vapor and vaping products, advising the District is kicking off a stakeholder engagement process to evaluate potential policy options for vaping in public. In a 2012 survey the District conducted in most Snohomish County middle and high schools, 5% of seniors reported using vaping devices; that increased to 22% in the 2014 survey, an explosive increase. Vaping devices are not proven safe although they may be safer than cigarettes. They are a device for delivering many drugs; used primarily for nicotine but also to vaporize THC, the main ingredient in marijuana.

Dr. Goldbaum explained Snohomish Health District is an independent health district, the largest Board of Health in the State, but is not part of Snohomish County although they serve the entirety of Snohomish County. He displayed a graph illustrating total funding (local, state and federal) and population, explaining funding has decreased dramatically since the recession while the population continues to increase and the number of health problems has also increased. He provided a comparison of dollars per resident for all the counties in the State, Snohomish Health District's funding is 34<sup>th</sup> of 35 or \$22/resident. He commented Snohomish Health District is losing its place as a leading county capable of addressing health issues. Continuing this trend will result in more staff cuts, decreased impact, and fewer services.

He provided ways the Health District and the City can work together:

- Help us get the word out
- Connect us with other partners in community
- Involve us in policy planning and work groups
- Support in finding solutions to sustainable public health funding

Councilmember Buckshnis referred to the national debate regarding the vaccination of children and asked his opinion on vaccinating. Dr. Goldbaum responded vaccinations are one of the most important public health advances of the 20<sup>th</sup> century; it would be a disservice if the District did not promote vaccinations. His two children as well as he have all their vaccines. There was no question; the science is compelling that vaccines save lives.

Councilmember Buckshnis said she was provided a list of 68 fields in Washington State with artificial turf with crumb rubber. She asked whether he had an opinion on crumb rubber. Dr. Goldbaum responded this was a difficult issue for any jurisdictions with artificial turf fields. As a public health practitioner, he must look to the science; at the moment, there are still a lot of unknowns and there has not been compelling evidence that the fields pose a direct health hazard. He recognized concern in the community will demand further study. This is an issue that could become divisive in the community; he did not want families avoiding their children getting good physical activity and engaging in healthy activities as well as what they learn when engaging in sports.

Council President Fraley-Monillas thanked Dr. Goldbaum for his leadership in the county on health issues. She expressed her appreciation for Dr. Goldbaum and his team's involvement in the response



following the Oso slide. His staff spent an outrageous amount of time at the slide assisting with various functions.

Mayor Earling said he recently met with a citizen who explained naloxone is potentially a lifesaving drug in certain situations. He asked whether the City's Police Department has been contacted regarding the naloxone kits. Dr. Goldbaum did not know if Edmonds Police Department had been contacted yet. The District is also trying to identify funding to ensure the kits are available to all first responders. The kits have been distributed via the syringe exchange program in Snohomish County and there are two reports of lives saved in Snohomish County in the past 6 months.

Mayor Earling referred to Dr. Goldbaum's participation in Snohomish County Cities, commenting it was very beneficial to have him attend several meetings. The other Councilmembers and Mayors in that group also appreciate his participation.

Councilmember Mesaros referred to the District's funding and Snohomish County being next to last in providing resources for public health and asked about practical steps could be taken to improve that and get it to at least the average. . Dr. Goldbaum responded historically it was a shared State and County responsibility. Having an effective public health system in Snohomish County and across the State that assures access to high quality service requires a State solution. He looked to City electeds to advocate for a State solution as City electeds can speak to State electeds more effectively than public health. Councilmember Mesaros asked the source of the District current funding. Dr. Goldbaum answered federal, state and local which includes Snohomish County property tax and sales tax.

#### **6A. PUBLIC HEARING: ILA WITH EDMONDS SCHOOL DISTRICT FOR WOODWAY FIELDS**

Parks & Recreation Director Carrie Hite provided a brief background, explaining this project has been a long time identified goal for the City and the Edmonds park system, dating back to the closure of the former Woodway High School. It was officially adopted in the City's PROS Plan in 2001 and has been identified in subsequent planning documents. Edmonds does not provide adequate field space for the amount of teams and play time needed in the community. The City has had a long standing, successful partnership with the Edmonds School District (ESD) for the use of several fields to meet some of this need. The City currently has Interlocal Agreements (ILA) with ESD for the use of Meadowdale playfields, Madrona K-8 field and Edmonds Elementary. These additional fields and the only full size synthetic turf fields at former Woodway High School would provide a definite value for the citizens and athletic teams in Edmonds year-round. These fields will help expand opportunities for year-round fitness and increase opportunity for physical activity as noted by Dr. Goldbaum.

The most recent PROS Plan adopted February 2014 after a tremendous amount of public input and a random sample telephone survey identified this project as a top priority. The ILA gives the City the rights and responsibilities of using, scheduling, operating and maintaining the fields. After discussing maintenance needs and regiments with ESD, the designer and other local jurisdictions, it was determined the approximate cost of maintaining a synthetic turf field is \$5,000-\$10,000/year. The revenues from the rental of the fields would be adequate to provide staffing and support for year-round maintenance.

The decision being considered as part of tonight's public hearing is the City's role as a partner in this project along with the State, Verdant Health Commission and the ESD. The Council is being asked to authorize the Mayor to enter into an ILA with ESD to schedule, use, operate, maintain and provide \$500,000 of the \$4.2 million funding for construction of the two fields. The capital contribution for this project has been adopted by Council as part of the 2015 budget. If the City chooses not to sign the ILA, it would impact the City's ability to schedule the fields, control playing time, usage, provide drop-in times for the nearly 40,000 residents of Edmonds and the surrounding area, and the field closing times. In addition, it would continue to impact the lack of field availability for Edmonds programs and accessibility

for Edmonds teams. It will also impact the City's goals and plans to install a community garden at the site as well as impact the City's long standing relationship with the ESD and Verdant.

The decision regarding materials used in this project is that of the ESD. The City has been reassured by ESD that they have done their due diligence in material selection and have considered comments from the public, Snohomish Health District, the State and other local experts. ESD also hired a consultant, Elisabeth Black, to review current studies and provide an analysis for ESD. ESD has installed this product since 2001 and has experienced no concerns until now. After performing this due diligence, the School Board vote to move forward with the project and the crumb rubber infill. The ESD will move forward whether or not the City signs the ILA. She believed it would be helpful for the Council to hear a high level executive summary from Dr. Black to better understand current information that is available about crumb rubber.

Elisabeth Black explained she was hired by ESD in April to do an independent review of documents related to crumb rubber, health effects associated with crumb rubber and any research done to date. The ESD provided her with 32 separate documents and she looked beyond those documents to others she could find, most scientific journal articles. The 32 documents organized by category of publishing entity are as follows:

- Studies or information provided by or produced for public agencies (14)
- Scientific peer - reviewed journal publications (5)
- Public interest group writings (5)
- Studies conducted or commissioned by the private turf industry (3)
- Periodicals (2)
- Community news (1)
- Legislation (1)
- Product user assessment (1)

She provided a summary of her review of the literature. The documents offered a broad perspective on the issues of actual and theoretical health risks associated with artificial turf fields with crumb rubber. For her purposes, the risks were divided into actual health risks, those that are not disputed and based on scientific or physical evidence; and theoretical health risks which are those that seem plausible, but are not yet substantiated by scientific or physical evidence. Some of the documents illustrated the advantages of artificial turf fields over grass fields for safety and environmental benefits:

- Artificial turf fields require reduced water usage
- Installation of artificial turf fields may result in overall reduced costs and effort to maintain
- Artificial turf fields may avoid the use of pesticides, herbicides, and other lawn chemicals required to maintain a grass field
- The extra cushion provided by artificial turf fields may reduce the frequency or severity of fractures and other traumatic injuries
- Artificial turf fields offer the ability to play on the field during a variety of weather conditions
- Artificial turf fields provide a recycling alternative for the vast stockpile of waste tires

Some documents highlight what can be considered actual health risks or hazards associated with playing on artificial turf fields with crumb rubber. These include:

- Artificial turf field surfaces can develop elevated heat relative to natural surfaces
- Athletes who fall on artificial turf fields can have friction burns or turf abrasions

The larger issue, and one much more difficult to manage and address, is the theoretical risks associated with artificial turf and crumb rubber. The theoretical risks are assigned by theory based on the materials present in the artificial turf and crumb rubber and what is known about these chemicals in other applications. The chemicals and properties of concern associated with artificial turf and crumb rubber are:

- Volatile organic compounds and semi-volatile organic compounds, such as benzothiazole, hexadecane, 4-(tert-Octyl)-phenol, and butylated hydroxyanisole
- Polynuclear aromatic hydrocarbons, such as hydroxypyrene
- Metals, such as lead, zinc, selenium, and cadmium. It should be noted that the use of lead chromate in new artificial turf has been greatly reduced compared to earlier field materials
- Carbon black, a petroleum product formed by incomplete combustion of heavy petroleum products, which accounts for an estimated 80 percent of tire mass
- Particulate, usually studied in crumb rubber studies as PM-10, but also referenced in the documents in nano-particulate size.

Studies that appear to exhibit rigorous scientific validity find no additional risk from the chemicals or physical properties of artificial turf and crumb rubber. Many of the studies note that the chemicals are already prevalent in our environment. The addition of exposures from turf fields with crumb rubber do not appear to increase risk above what is already present in the population. The materials present from crumb rubber that may be encountered on a playfield are no different than tire wear on the road.

The documents acknowledge that health assessments of artificial turf fields with crumb rubber are made more complicated by a number of factors:

- The variety of material used in the products
- The variety of applications. For example, artificial turf with crumb rubber on indoor fields appears to have more evidence of potential exposures without the advantage of natural ventilation and dilution
- The age and condition of the field material

The studies acknowledge that turf field materials contain hazardous constituents and that the public, notably children, are in contact with these hazardous constituents. What has not been demonstrated, however, is an exposure pathway by which the constituents can enter the body of the field users and do damage or initiate disease. For a hazardous material to actually present a risk for the end user there has to be a pathway of exposure and a way for the chemical to do damage.

All studies acknowledge that additional data is needed to more fully assess potential exposures and possible health risks associated with the use of artificial turf fields with crumb rubber. In the meantime, leading public health agencies, such as the EPA and Consumer Product Safety Commission, are supporting continued use of artificial turf fields with crumb rubber.

Councilmember Bloom asked who at the ESD selected the 32 studies she was asked to review. Dr. Black answered the person she worked most closely with was Matt Finch but she was not aware how the documents were selected. It was her sense that it was what they had found in their own research; a wide variety of documents, from public interest group writings to more academic journal articles to information from public agencies who have grappled with the same issue. Councilmember Bloom asked whether Mr. Finch had a scientific background. Dr. Black answered not that she knew of.

Councilmember Bloom referred to the reference to chemicals of concern including lead, relaying that her research found there were multiple other heavy metals in crumb rubber. Dr. Black agreed the four of note that she saw in the documents are lead, zinc, selenium, and cadmium. Councilmember Bloom asked about nano-particles in carbon black. Dr. Black answered carbon black is categorized as possible human carcinogen by the International Agency for Research on Cancer (IARC); the studies indicate a chemical can have toxicity but it must be in the right dose and form for it to enter the body and do harm. The studies and cancer data about carbon black are from industries where people are working with very fine particulate carbon black all day for 40 years. The studies with artificial turf fields and crumb rubber could not replicate the particle size or dose.

Councilmember Bloom said some of the information she reviewed referenced nano-particles or carbon black could potentially have a risk similar to asbestos and that it should be studied further. She asked whether Dr. Black reviewed any studies of that nature. Dr. Black answered no, explaining what she knows of asbestos and carbon black, asbestos causes damage in a very different way than carbon black. Asbestos fibers act like barbs in the deep lung which defense cell attack, building up scar tissue which starts abnormal cell growth which can lead to cancer or asbestosis, scarring of the lungs. Carbon black's method of causing cancer and disease is completely different.

Councilmember Bloom observed it is considered a carcinogenic. She asked whether other carcinogens were reviewed in the documents. Dr. Black answered tire material is a petroleum based product and there are other carcinogens associated with petroleum based products such as benzene and others that are listed in her summary. The studies indicate those are present but found they are not available to be taken in by the body. She provided the example of a mercury thermometer; mercury is very toxic but because it is contained and could not enter the body, it is innocuous. Councilmember Bloom questioned that analogy; mercury is contained in a glass shaft versus crumb rubber that is spread on a field. Dr. Black said the chemical in its hazardous form is not being taken into the body. For example crumb rubber has not been found in that minute particle size to cause damage; the studies she reviewed did not find that and she reviewed studies beyond what the ESD provided.

Councilmember Buckshnis thanked Dr. Black for her report. She referenced a KOMO News report about soccer players and asked if that was at the University of Washington. Dr. Black answered yes. Councilmember Buckshnis asked the outcome of that study. Dr. Black answered no study has been initiated yet. She agreed the KOMO News report was horrible, young female goalies with cancer. What needs to happen is a good, longitudinal, long term epidemiological study to see if there is a connection however, no studies like that has been done and as a scientist it seems like circumstantial evidence. When a chemical is causing cancer or disease, it will usually cause same cancer; these cancers are not all the same. For example tobacco smoking causes lung cancer, it doesn't also cause melanoma. She did not know very much about the KOMO report but did not see a connection.

Councilmember Buckshnis commented artificial turf has been used on football fields since 1964; nothing has been heard about football players. She asked if Dr. Black reviewed any studies regarding impacts on football players or was it only soccer players. Dr. Black answered there had not been a study done on the female soccer players and she had seen no studies regarding increased disease in athletes that is contributed to artificial turf fields or crumb rubber.

Councilmember Buckshnis commented cancer can be genetic. She asked whether there was any time pattern for the goalies and whether a causal effect could be provided. Dr. Black answered she did not know, and believed it was just coincidence. She did not see a see cause and effect based on her experience.

Councilmember Petso said it is agreed the product contains hazardous chemicals including known and potential carcinogens. Dr. Black answered yes. Councilmember Petso said it is also agreed a good study is needed. Dr. Black agreed a lot of good studies are needed.

Councilmember Nelson observed the ESD has had artificial turf fields since 2001. He asked whether the fields had ever been tested. Ms. Hite responded her understanding was the fields were tested every year. That same regiment would be required for the Woodway fields. ESD's contract with field contractor requires them to test once a year. Gmax testing is done by an independent testing agency. Councilmember Nelson asked what it tested for. Ms. Hite answered compaction; the most important aspect is ensuring there is enough fill for fall protection.

Council President Fraley-Monillas referred to an issue a citizen raised with her today regarding #8 in the ILA. She asked about the City's liability since the City is a partner but is not installing the fields. City Attorney Jeff Taraday answered the ILA has a mutual indemnification provision in Section 8 which is commonly included in any ILA the City enters into with any other governmental entity. In laymen's terms, each party indemnifies the other party for anything wrong they do. Council President Fraley-Monillas asked whether the City would be liable if something occurred on the fields due to the makeup of the fields. Mr. Taraday answered because the City was not involved in the material selection, that would be the ESD's responsibility. Council President Fraley-Monillas was unsure the Interlocal Agreement was clear enough and suggested it include more explanatory language. Mr. Taraday offered to provide another version of Section 8 if the Council wishes to make it clearer.

Councilmember Bloom read the indemnification clause: *"Each party agrees to indemnify, defend, and hold the other party harmless from any claims, lawsuits, costs, and judgments arising as a result of each party's involvement in the design, construction, material selection and use of the Former Woodway Fields under this Agreement. To further describe the scope of the preceding sentence, the School District and Edmonds shall each be responsible for any and all liability arising from any negligent or wrongful acts or omissions including those of its own agents, employees, contractors, or officials."* Councilmember Bloom observed the second sentence seemed to say the City was on the hook. If the ESD is sued for any reason related to the crumb rubber, the City will also be a party to the lawsuit and join in defending the ESD as well as itself. Mr. Taraday suggested rather than discussing whether the language reflects the intent, that he provide another version that more clearly articulates the intent. The intent is the indemnification would protect the City against wrongful acts of the School District and protect the School District against wrongful acts of the City; that is essentially what a mutual indemnification clause does.

Councilmember Bloom commented the City can be sued for any reason. She asked whether Mr. Taraday was saying if the ESD is sued, the City does not have any involvement even the City goes along with crumb rubber on the fields. Mr. Taraday clarified he was saying if the ESD is sued because of some action the City took, the City would have to defend the ESD. If the City were sued for something the ESD did, like the selection of the crumb rubber, the ESD would have to defend the City. Councilmember Bloom asked whether entering into the ILA, the City was agreeing to the crumb rubber. Mr. Taraday said the ILA makes it clear that was the ESD's decision.

**COUNCILMEMBER MESAROS MOVED, SECONDED BY COUNCILMEMBER BUCKSHNIS, TO POSTPONE ANY DECISION ON THE ILA UNTIL THE AUGUST 4, 2015 MEETING TO ALLOW FOR TESTIMONY THAT WILL BE HEARD THIS EVENING AND FOR THE INFORMATION FROM THE SCHOOL DISTRICT, TO ALLOW COUNCILMEMBERS TO ABSORB THE INFORMATION AND ASK QUESTIONS OVER THE COURSE OF THE NEXT TWO WEEKS.**

Council President Fraley-Monillas relayed Councilmembers Nelson and Buckshnis and she met with ESD Superintendent yesterday. He provided each Councilmember a binder with all the reports that have been done and all the information the ESD has had. She suggested it would be a good idea for the Council to take time to read both sides of the issue. The Superintendent made it very clear that if the Council does not enter into this partnership with the ESD, the ESD will no longer consider the City a partner in this and potentially other items. He made it clear the City would not have any say over the fields including scheduling or what occurs when the neighbors have issues; the neighbors will need take up any problems with the ESD. She recalled the neighbors' concerns with noise, light, traffic, etc. associated with the fields.

Councilmember Nelson agreed the Superintendent was clear, but the City can be clear too. With regard to postponing a decision to August 4, he suggested allowing an additional week. Council President Fraley-Monillas said the Superintendent was agreeable to extending the decision on the ILA to allow Council an

opportunity to review the information. He said basically the fields will be installed and the ILA will not slow down the process.

Councilmember Bloom said if the Council was expected to review the material from the ESD, she wanted to have every single email and every reference that every person in the room and others have made to other studies provided to the Council for review. That would allow Council to review both sides; she was unwilling to look at the issue unless all that information was included. She stated Superintendent Brossoit is not the School District, he is one person. He seems to be saying they are moving forward regardless of what the elected officials have to say and what everyone will be presenting tonight. The Council is being strong-armed by five people, Superintendent Nick Brossoit and four School Board Members (one School Board Member, April Nowak, voted against crumb rubber). These five are holding the City hostage, saying if the City does not enter into the ILA and use the product that many think is hazardous, they will not cooperate with the City on future endeavors.

Councilmember Mesaros said he extended the decision to August 4 because it was a regular meeting; next week is a study session when the Council typically does not take action. He was not opposed to discussing and taking action next week.

Councilmember Petso commented it is most irregular to make a motion prior to a public hearing on an item that the Council was not certain it would take action on tonight. She will support the motion with 2 purposes in mind: 1) make an effort to get everybody around the table and talk about Verdant's offer to provide extra funding to change the field surface, and 2) make changes to the ILA. She was not aware that that the ESD has said the City must sign this precise ILA or they will never partner with the City on anything. She was hopeful the City could discuss with ESD ways to alter the ILA including the possibility of putting the City in control of future selection of turf. Ms. Hite responded the ILA draft is a document to be negotiated with the ESD; they have not seen this draft ILA that was developed by ESD and City with assistance from their attorneys. It was her understanding the 32 studies the ESD provided Dr. Black were studies provided by citizens at public meetings and Dr. Black also reviewed other material. She acknowledged it was not an inclusive list of all the studies.

Council President Fraley-Monillas encouraged Council to meet with Dr. Brossoit and ESD Board Members during the next two week. Carl Zapora, Verdant, clarified with her that Verdant stated they would consider donating more money toward a different field product. She suggested Councilmembers may also want to talk to Verdant during next two weeks. Councilmember Bloom referred to a letter Carl Zapora's sent to the Council, "Verdant also indicated its willingness to consider additional support for alternative artificial turf surfaces should the Edmonds School District so request." Council President Fraley-Monillas agreed Mr. Zapora said Verdant would consider additional support, not give it for sure.

Councilmember Buckshnis said a ballot measure that included these fields and artificial turf was supported by 68,000 voters. She said there are people who do not have a problem with this but they are afraid to speak.

**COUNCILMEMBER BUCKSHNIS CALLED THE QUESTION. COUNCILMEMBER MESAROS SECONDED. MOTION TO CALL THE QUESTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

**MAIN MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

Mayor Earling opened public hearing at 8:06 p.m., advising the public hearing will end at 9:06 p.m. and the 3 minute time limit will be strictly enforced.

**Beth Marriott, Edmonds**, Athletic and Activities Director, Meadowdale High School, described the use the fields would have by students in the ESD: after school by district athletic teams, namely the high

school soccer team and especially students that typically do not have the best fields such as freshman players, in the spring by EWHS boys soccer team who are displaced by district track meets every Thursday, the Mountlake Terrace boys soccer team who currently practice in the evening at Lynnwood High School (the one Mountlake Terrace turf field is used by the baseball team in the spring), and practice and games for four girls middle school softball teams. The ESD receives more requests for practice and games than can be filled. The ESD has maintained strong relationship with community partners. They want to provide opportunity for kids throughout the ESD to have fields to play on year-round including the local Boys & Girls Clubs, SnoKing and select groups. ESD also has a unified program for students with special needs; they currently do not have a soccer field and every game the unified teams play are away because they do not have a home field.

**Chris Gradwohl, Edmonds**, said he has been active in sports coaching his children in basketball, baseball, soccer and football through SnoKing Pacific Little League and NW Junior Football League on which he currently serves as vice president. He is also the founder and vice president of Edmonds Warrior Junior Football that serves over 200 boys and girls in football and cheer in the Edmonds-Woodway area. In his over 20 years of coaching, the lack of fields has been a problem. Kids now practice on grassy, muddy fields, made even worse by goose poop. Increasing fields for all sports is a good thing. As Dr. Goldbaum mentioned, athletes who participate in team sports are less likely to get involved in drugs, less likely to get pregnant as teens and more likely to graduate from high school. With regard to the comment the Superintendent Brossoit was strong-arming the Council, he noted there have been numerous hearings and Dr. Brossoit may be trying to spur the Council to action which he appreciated. With regard to the resistance to the fields and crumb rubber, he referred to the earlier report from a scientist. He has done his own research and would not put his or anyone's kids in a situation he felt was unsafe. He acknowledged chemicals are present but not at a measurable level or a level that creates concern. There are hazardous things in soil, there is not a ban proposed on soil. If crumb rubber was causing cancer at the alarming rate that some seem to think or as one person screamed at a hearing was poisoning children, the data does not bear that out. Over the last 15 years, more than 11,000 of these fields have been put in play, yet cancer, specifically Non-Hodgkin's lymphoma has remained level. He urged the Council to defer to the science and not feelings.

**Cliff Sanderlin, Edmonds**, recalled the last time he spoke to the Council was when he, Councilmember Petso and others were trying to persuade the Council to purchase a playfield in southwest Edmonds that was surplus by ESD which would have been Edmonds' only full-size soccer field. He asked why ESD would not simply agree to use a different infill. An aging athlete himself, he understood the need for facilities, but did not understand ESD's reluctance to find another infill product or use grass as was used in southwest Edmonds for 50 years. Second he asked why crumb rubber was banned in Norway and Sweden and increasingly in other communities in the U.S. There is a lot of research available. Although not a scientist, he worked at Fred Hutchinson Cancer Research Center and knew someone had to pay to accumulate research/data; so far no big money has accumulated information about this topic. Even if there was a causal relationship between crumb rubber and blood cancers, cancers may not appear for 12-20 years. Third, he wondered if the turf industry, a booming business because of the drought and the willingness of big school districts to spend money, may be replicating the work done by the tobacco industry who spent money to send the very best PR people to every small community in the country to add confusion and question the scientific data.

**Laura Johnson, Edmonds**, said four months ago she, like the Council, Verdant, ESD, did not know tires contained toxins and carcinogens like butadiene, a carcinogen linked to leukemia; benzene, a carcinogen and reproductive toxin; phthalates which are endocrine and reproductive toxins; carbon black, a carcinogen that makes up 30% of the tires; that no long term studies had been conducted on crumb rubber; and that people are unwillingly and blindly trusting short term studies, many of which are funded or have ties to the industry making money from this product. The studies are limited, have some level of uncertainty and many call for more research. She did not know she was allowing her child to play on a

surface that under other applications requires safety labeling and warning. A bottle of crumb rubber ordered from Amazon has a clear safety label. Precautions must be taken when installing the product and within the tire industry there is a list of carcinogens and suggestions to keep safe. She did not know that by allowing her child to play on the field she was taking part in a large, national experiment by exposing him to a product considered toxic in many other situations but called safe when ground up and spread on children's playfields without even a warning label. Now she knows; now the City Council, Verdant and ESD know. ESD Superintendent Brossoit's email to Verdant after their vote to use crumb rubber stated, "I am wondering if at the minimum we might want to post signs at our fields across the district that it is recommended that all field users wash hands and take showers following use of fields and for parents of small children to be more mindful of what their kids might be eating, sampling, etc. Just as dirt is not a recommended diet, I suspect that many of the infill materials were not designed to be ingested." One School Board Member stated "tires contain toxins and carcinogens and that kids might ingest them, they are things you don't want in your body.": He also stated "they looked at studies but they are very limited and most call for more research. There are alternatives. One that has been widely used in Italy but is limited here in the Northwest. We did not want to be leaders and go with a product largely untested in the Northwest. We did not want to take the risk." She said instead ESD chose to take a risk with children's health.

**Scott Schaefer, Edmonds**, expressed support for turf fields in Edmonds. He has two sons, a recent Meadowdale High School graduate and sophomore, and has participated in youth sports through SnoKing, club soccer, school and Pacific Little League. He did not want to waste everyone's time discussing the pros and cons of crumb rubber fields as the Council has already heard from experts. As a field scheduler for Pacific Little League for ten years, he was aware of the difficulties scheduling practices and games with the limited number of fully usable fields in the Edmonds area. During fall and spring, rainouts wreak havoc with the schedule. He commented on the difficulty explaining to an out-of-state grandmother that she could not watch her grandson's baseball game when it was rained out. With over 600 kids participating in Pacific Little League, any rainout results in a trickle-down of makeup games that affect over 400 families during a rainy week. Not having enough turf fields has a major impact. The former Woodway grass field has been a disaster waiting to happen. He personally witnessed games cancelled due to six inches of standing water and a 1970s graduate stated the field was hazardous even back then. Many families with kids playing youth sports must travel to Lynwood High School for weekday evening practices. His older son, headed to WSU as a kicker on the football team, was unable to be here tonight because he had to drive to Einstein's turf field in Shoreline to practice due to the shortage of fields in Edmonds. He summarized more turf fields are needed in Edmonds.

**Mary Jo Schaefer, Edmonds**, spoke strongly in favor of the need for turf fields in Edmonds. A longtime resident whose kids as well as she attended ESD schools, she is now the Treasurer of the Meadowdale High School Sports Booster Club. Her family has been involved in sports in Edmonds for over 15 years through school, SnoKing, Pacific Little League and club sports. It is common knowledge physical activity is important for kids. Any major decision involves risk and reward; in this case she argued the reward of the extra physical activity that will be made available to kids by having more turf fields in Edmonds far outweighs any unproven risk. Turf fields provide the necessary space for organized teams practice and games in an area that gets a lot of rain. As a parent of high school aged kids, participating in sports is a critically important part of their lives, especially in the years from adolescence to young adult. Statistics show student athletes are more likely to stay in school and to do well academically. The Meadowdale Sports Booster Club gladly pays for any student athlete to participate on a sports team if their family cannot afford it because they recognize how important sports can be for kids. One of the key pieces for sports in the Northwest is having turf fields available. It is important for leadership to make a decision that benefits all citizens of Edmonds, young and old and to remember the reason for the project in the first place, the obvious and long standing need for additional turf fields for kids.



**David Harvey, Edmonds**, President, Meadowdale High School Booster Club, said his biggest concern related to the shortage of fields, having 2 kids who played sports and coaching youth sports for over 15 years, is leaving kids out. SnoKing can only take a certain number of kids on teams due to the lack of field space. More important is the usability of fields; although a team may get a scheduled practice time, but the field may be unusable. In the Pacific Northwest, timing of play on grass, dirt, mud and sand fields is limited and those fields pose a threat of injury. It has been shown that turf fields are much safer with regard to children's and adults' injuries. It has also been proven that kids who are active in sports are less likely to be involved in negative influences. Turf fields are easy to maintain and provide year-round use. He understood the recent concerns about crumb rubber used in the fields but he looked to the experts and scientific proof. Every college, high school and professional sport has been using these fields for decades. There is no substantial, proven evidence that there is a cause directly correlated with crumb rubber. He understood the concern with the safety of children and the risk with playing on these fields; people deal with risks every day.

**David Tingsted, Edmonds**, an attorney sanctioned by the Washington Interscholastic Activities Association, said he often speaks with coaches regarding their legal responsibilities. Coaches must ensure the environment they place kids in is safe. What that is measured against is not whether something is harmful or not; goalposts are really harmful if you run into one. The industry standard is the measurement upon which coaches place themselves. For example, if a pool is not deep enough according to industry standards, you cannot swim or dive in that pool. The product that the ESD has chosen is consistent with the industry standard. The Council's job is not to evaluate whether or not crumb rubber is harmful or not, it is whether it is reasonable and within the scope of what other programs use. ESD uses crumb rubber on many fields including Meadowdale High School and this material has been installed in 11,000 other fields and used for years. In a courtroom the City could defend itself stating it made a reasonable choice because it was the industry standard. He urged the Council to consider that standard and to vote in favor of the ILA.

**Cathy Jackson, Brier**, the fields scheduler and administrator for NW Nationals Premier Soccer Club, responsible for scheduling over 33 soccer teams, kids ages 8-18 who play year-round. Their league's boundaries are the boundaries of the ESD. For six months of the year they are usually able to get the space they need using a combination of grass and turf in the summer and 100% turf in the winter. During fall and spring, their busiest periods of league play, they cannot get the fields they need to accommodate 33 teams all of whom practice twice a week and have games on the weekend. During the summer and winter they typically have 4 teams on a field, each team getting ¼ of a field for 90 minutes. In fall and spring, they sometimes have 7 teams to a field for 1 hour, 21 teams using 1 field. Although people say there are plenty of grass fields, that is not the case; if there were grass fields available, they would be using them. ESD gives priority for rec programs that use most of the grass fields suitable for their use. She described the use of fields by SnoKing soccer and baseball, Mountlake Terrace and Brier. If this facility is not turf, their organization will never get a chance to use it. High schools are using more of their own space and more rec programs are starting up including new rec lacrosse which puts a huge strain on fields. For their club in particular, since they hold tryouts, they are further down on the list for fields; recreational programs who do not make cuts are given first priority. Just because their club is a premiere club does not mean their kids should be less important in finding a place to play. These kids have chosen to make soccer their sport of choice and choose to play year-round at a more competitive level. The turf would allow for year-round use and for their club to survive, they need more fields. They have been in favor of this project for years and she hoped progress would continue.

**April Osborne, Edmonds**, the mother of two athletes, and an administrative coach and on the board for the local junior football franchise for the past six years and her husband has been a local junior football coach for the past six years expressed their support for athletics. They have absolutely no problem with the use of synthetic turf fields; they have a problem with crumb rubber infill. There are safer, non-toxic alternative choices used globally and in the U.S. and Canada which are a possibility for the ESD. Four

people plus Superintendent Brossoit made a choice to install crumb rubber which contains known carcinogens in a neighborhood, within yards of classroom windows, and above an aquifer that provides water to the residents of Edmonds, simply because everybody else does it. The citizens and children of this community and others around the country are being used in a massive science experience. Changing the name and shape of a toxic material, grinding it into small bits and calling it recycled material does not make it non-toxic. As a resident of Edmonds, she asked the Council to stand up for what is right and endure the pushback and consequences. She asked the Council to put a moratorium on the use of crumb rubber in the City of Edmonds and withdraw support for the project at the former Woodway High unless the Edmonds School Board agrees to use a safe, non-toxic infill. She described how crumb rubber gets into the body; her son comes home from football practice with crumb rubber pellets abraded under his skin, in his ears, in the corners of his eyes, in his nose and they come out when he coughs. Her younger son plays on the sidelines during football practice and his skin is covered in a black tarry substance that must be scrubbed off with soap. She appreciated the Council doing its due diligence and taking time to listen to the community.

**Tammy Dunn, Lynnwood**, Sports Development Manager, Snohomish County Tourism Bureau, and Snohomish County Sports Commission, said the ILA with ESD for the development and use of the Woodway playfields will provide quality community fields, enhance community athletic programs for local teams, generate sales tax revenue and support jobs. Sports development is a huge opportunity for rural and urban communities. Community athletic fields help people of all ages stay active and healthy and improving the fields will provide an opportunity for local youth and adults to participate in a variety of sports such as lacrosse, soccer, football, baseball and softball year-round. Sports field development also serves visitors; visiting sports teams have a significant impact on the region. In 2014 the Snohomish County Sports Commission, working with various sports programs, had an economic impact of over \$37.1 million in Snohomish County. They recognize there is a shortage of fields to serve the needs of Snohomish County, particularly south Snohomish County. They are also working with the Edmonds, Everett and Snohomish County School Districts to allow youth to play tournaments at home. She relayed their support for infrastructure development that will increase the ability to enhance residents' way of life, increase the ability to bring tournament events and related economic impact to Snohomish County.

**Doug Swartz, Edmonds**, referred to paragraph 8 regarding indemnification, explaining after reading the two sentences in the indemnification section to a city attorney in the District of Columbia, he said the two sentences do not say what he believed the intent was and needed to be reworded to clarify that each party is responsible for their actions. Next, he referred to the concept of acceptable risk; he was in the Army when Agent Orange was considered an acceptable risk in Vietnam because there were no other alternatives. The concept of acceptable risk should only be applied when there are no equivalent or better alternatives. He was disheartened that acceptable risk was still being discussed when there are equivalent or better alternatives available. Third, with regard to the credibility of Dr. Black's study, typically when one does a study, they are not provided a pile of documents for review; he found that highly suspect. Further Dr. Black said the material is inaccessible; the studies he has read say that is not true and categorically state under normal conditions of use the temperature gets high enough on the fields that known carcinogens are accessible.

**Diana White, President, Edmonds School Board**, said she has been where the Council is, sitting where there is a lot of pressure from a small, very vocal group about their opposition to the turf fields. When the School Board first heard opposition and were inundated with reports, they decided to hire Dr. Black. The issue was vetted very thoroughly and she was proud of the work the Board did and she stood behind the Board and their decision. The safety of the children in the District, including her own who are athletes and spend a great deal of time on the fields, is very important to the Board. The fields are for the good of all students in the five Snohomish County cities the District serves. She asked the Council to carefully look at the ramifications of the decision now and in the future. The Edmonds School Board, City of Edmonds

and Verdant are partners in this project now and for many years. She urged the Council to support the ILA and not to ban future turf fields.

**Christi Davis, Brier**, took issue with a lot of Dr. Black's interpretations and did not believe she understood the Norwegian study that showed in an indoor environment in Italy, crumb rubber infill creates dust in the air and carbon black is part of that dust. It is very fine particles that get in the air and when breathed in, it stays in the lungs for months. Carbon black is small enough it can get into an organ in the body, pass through the lungs into the blood and brain. The level of dust and carbon black in the air is unknown on an outdoor field because that has never been looked at. She acknowledged there have been difficulties in detecting VOCs and other gases that off-gas on outdoor fields due to study locations such as downtown NYC next to a six lane highway and the use of stationary air monitors. Running, diving into the turf results in a much higher dose than can be detected by a stationary air monitor on the side of the field. When mobile air monitors or breathing space air monitors are used, higher levels of gases are detected. The studies that have been done do not look at interaction affects, the chemical affects in the body. Risk assessments that have been done based on EPA guidelines are useless; the risks children are being exposed to are unknown because the studies have not been done. Most of the cancers are lymphomas and leukemia, blood cancers, exactly the cancer that would be expected based on the carcinogens that players are exposed to. Crumb rubber has only been used as an infill since about 2000; cancers will begin to be seen now and in the future because it takes decades for them appear. She asked the Council to be leaders, recognizing there will be repercussions and tell the world that public health and the environment matters.

**Maggie Pinson, Edmonds**, referred to a letter and article she emailed to the Council today regarding the carcinogenic potential in low dose exposure to chemicals in the environment. A former board certified oncology nurse who worked for several years at a major, premier cancer facility in Seattle, she explained cancer is a very complicated range of diseases and unless one had a great deal of insight, it is easy to misunderstand. Thirty-five years ago two primary theories evolved about the causes of cancer: the first theory that was studied was carcinogens had to be present at a high enough dose to induce cancer. The second theory that has gained traction in the last three decades is low level of toxin are also likely causes of cancer. The difference is a high enough dose of a particular carcinogen is a bullet and one bullet will cause cancer. The other is multiple toxins work in synergy in a negative manner, a shotgun approach, much like a group of hyenas that are able to take down an elephant. The article she provided the Council has 173 co-authors from the world's best research institutions. She encouraged the Council to read the article, give it to their doctors, put it on the Council's website and ask the Snohomish Health District County director to read it. Crumb rubber is made of tires; tires were hazardous waste during the 1970s and 1980s; they were subsequently re-categorized as solid waste but that did not change their toxic nature. Tires contain carcinogens, heavy metals, phthalates, endocrine destructors, carbon black and other toxins, many of which are unknown because the manufacture of tires is a proprietary secret. Cancer develops in stages over decades; the chemicals in tires cause cancer and that is why crumb rubber is toxic.

**Steve White, Edmonds**, a parent and former coach, recognized ESD coaches and coaches at the junior levels have been seeking more turf fields for many years. The addition of this field should be seen as a victory and cause for celebration. He recalled when his son was a junior playing varsity baseball, his team played all their home games at the Terrace turf field; many of the JV team's games were canceled. To the question of why not use other turf fields, his understanding was there were no other viable alternatives; there was no track record of fields infill tested in this climate. The alternatives infills are more expensive initially, and potentially much more expensive long term and may fail long term. What drove the opposition to crumb rubber was data collected by a soccer coach, admittedly unscientific, stating he knew of a lot of soccer players that have cancer. He recognized there are carcinogens in the materials; that is not a scientific study but it leads to questions. A reasonable approach is to study it further to determine whether the level of toxins was dangerous to kids. That study has been done dozens of times in multiple state and countries; the consistent response is yes there are toxins but they are not at a level that poses risk

to kids. The Council can conclude more study is needed or conduct its own study; he questioned whether the result would be any different. At some point the Council needs to pull trigger and decide they have enough information to make a rational decision. As a parent and former coach, he was confident there was no risk to kids from this turf and he urged the Council to come to that same conclusion and make a reasonable decision.

**David Anderson, Shoreline**, a PhD in toxicology from the UW, commented on the papers that have been presented. He worked at the NRC lab for five years as a research scientist, working on effluence from nuclear power plants including the combined effects of multiple toxins. While working for the NRC, they found when more than one toxin is combined, there are combined effects, synergistic effects that are much worse and much greater than predicted from an individual toxin. When he reviewed the information that has been presented, the gradient report presented three options, but did not contrast the options, only discussing as a group crumb rubber. Their paper identifies another infill, Geoturf which is comprised of cork and coconut shell but they did not compare the two. The toxicity of cork and coconut shell is not detectable except for minerals. All the concerning organics in crumb rubber are not present in cork. The literature prepared by Dr. Black does not include any papers discussing Geoturf or cork and coconut shells. He suggested contrasting the options rather than grouping. He provided pictures of temperatures taken on Kellogg Middle School and Shorecrest High School fields; with an outside temperature of 83, the temperature on the turf soccer field was 140 degrees and 87 degrees on a grass field.

**Jen Carrigan, Edmonds**, clarified they are not against synthetic turf fields and do not dispute the need for more field space in Edmonds. They have 2 petitions on the subject with over 700 signatories; it is not just a small group of parents, students and neighbors, it is the greater Edmonds area and she represents them. Several friends and family members have experienced painful and terrifying battles with cancer; some survived and some have not. The cancer list of soccer players and soccer goalies who play on crumb rubber continues to grow. Anything that can be done now with the knowledge of carcinogens, heavy metals and toxins contained in tires that children in the community will play on, may eliminate frequent exposure to known carcinogens, especially for kids that may be more genetically predisposed to the risk. She asked the Council not to sign the ILA, which as currently written would allow the use of crumb rubber on the fields. She asked the Council to continue work on a ban on the use of crumb rubber in the City. They are grateful for the new fields, but are asking the City and ESD to take a leadership role and try the Geoplus natural infill that has a three year guarantee. When she first emailed the Council she was concerned about how the two fields would impact her family, friends, and community; as she learned more about crumb rubber, she realized this is a much bigger issue than these two fields. Awareness is being raised; there are national news reports about what is happening in Edmonds. By not signing the ILA, the Council has an opportunity to set a precedence that will made a difference for the future of children, the environment, and neighbors as well as make a difference nationally and globally.

**Tracey Peterson, Edmonds**, the mother of an 11-year old daughter who is a SnoKing soccer player and goalie, said they were first introduced to crumb rubber when she attended soccer camp at Edmonds Community College. After the first day, her socks were covered with tiny black rubber dots. She displayed socks her daughter wore two years ago that still have crumb rubber attached. Her daughter now has two sets of socks, crumb rubber socks for turf fields and socks for grass fields in an effort to keep crumb rubber out of her house. Her older daughter played soccer with the Special Olympics Program and has decided to go into Special Ed as a result of that program. Their team practiced and had games at Shoreline stadium; her white soled shoes were black after every game, carrying dust into her car. She has yet to sign up her younger daughter for SnoKing soccer because she did not know what type of fields she will play on. Although she was not opposed to artificial turf field, her daughter will not play goalie on crumb rubber fields. She suggested the Council consider options to crumb rubber like Kitsap has done.

**Carin Chase, Edmonds**, parent of an athlete that has played on fields for 10 years, was well aware new fields were needed. She found it curious that there was a perception people do not want turf fields;

everyone agrees, particularly parents of athletes, Edmonds fields need work. The issue is the infill. There also seems to be a mischaracterization that a small vocal minority is bringing this up; that is not the case. A quick google search on banning crumb rubber found the City of New York has banned it; counties in Los Angeles are considering a ban, and the Kitsap School District is putting in infill without carcinogens. The majority of the people present object to crumb rubber as an infill material. She urged the ESD and City Council to error on the side of caution and using the precautionary principle approach, use an alternative that does not cause cancer. The Kitsap School District are proud of the work they are doing on their fields, look for it to be one of the best fields in Washington and hope to be a model for districts and municipalities to follow. She encouraged anyone in Edmonds with any authority to look at what the Kitsap School District is doing.

**Senator Marilyn Chase**, said after attended many soccer games on the Woodway fields and getting tired of sinking in the mud, she talked to Mayor Earling about getting State funds to fix to the fields. The legislature provided \$750,000 to fix the fields because the City needed more fields. She has worked for many years in the legislature on environmental health issues, particularly on the Children's Safe Product Act, passed in 2008 and effective in 2010. The Act includes a list of chemicals of concern and has resulted in manufacturers removing toxic chemicals from their products. Crumb rubber is unregulated because it is a recycled product. The Children Safe Product Act will be opened during the next session to begin to address the issue of crumb rubber which contains as toluene and benzene, known carcinogens. She referred to industry standards from the tobacco industry about the safety of their product, pointing out not all products are safe. She urged the Council to remain engaged in the issue and to sign the ILA if that was required to remain engaged. It is a matter of health and she welcomed the City's partnership to ensure what is put on the fields is a safe product.

**Andrew Markiel, Edmonds**, reiterated the issue is crumb rubber, nothing else. He challenged the Council's thinking; the proposal is to put a substantial amount of zinc one mile from the Puget Sound with a substantial filter under the field to trap and keep the zinc from entering Puget Sound and believe everything will stay put in the next major earthquake exactly as planned. Trying to assess risk is very challenging because every possible case must be considered. We know this infill has toxins, the debate is whether it is far enough away so it is not a risk, which is a very dangerous thing to do. He pointed out one year ago the Environmental Protection Agency publically retracted their statement that crumb rubber is safe. Three months ago, the head of the Consumer Products Safety Commission publicly retracted their position that crumb rubber is a safe product; they did not say it was dangerous, they said they did not know. He asked the Council to very seriously consider the fact that two national agencies are no longer willing to stand behind this product, which causes serious doubts that anyone else can stand behind the product. He said the best solution is a better infill; if that happens everybody wins and everybody gets what they want.

**COUNCILMEMBER PETSO MOVED, SECONDED BY COUNCILMEMBER BLOOM, TO ALLOW THE REMAINING PEOPLE WHO WANT TO ADDRESS THIS TOPIC TO DO SO. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

**Dave Page, Edmonds**, said crumb rubber sounds horrible. As Dr. Black said, crumb rubber is made out of tires. There are 4 million registered vehicles in Washington state that have tires; the residue from those tires wearing out is not on the side of the road so it must be in the air. If that caused cancer, it would have cause a lot of cancer by now.

**Megan Drobnicki-Girdhar**, Special Education Teacher, VOICE Transition Program and Head Coach for Special Olympics Unified Sports Program in the ESD, described the positive impact the fields would have on these programs by allowing the Special Olympics Unified teams use of a field. The turf would allow their 4 soccer teams and 40 athletes with and without disabilities to use the fields more often because they could be used when it rains, allow them to host league play; they traveled to all their league

plan during the past year. The turf would also give them the ability to host the Unified district tournament; they current use Lynnwood High School. Most importantly turf fields would improve access for Special Olympic athletes, VOICE students and other persons with disabilities. Currently there is a significant slope down to the field and up to where play occurs; students in wheelchairs cannot use the field independently. The mission of the VOICE Transition program is to facilitate independence. Turf fields provide better access to all students with disabilities, especially those with balance issues due to concerns with fields with potholes and uneven grass surfaces.

**Alvin Rutledge, Edmond**, said this is the sixth meeting he has attended for the ESD, Verdant and the City. Ms. Hite, the City and ESD are doing the right thing and have the right information. He referred to an appeal signed by the City Attorney, City Clerk and Mayor that allows 20 days for an appeal. An appeal was filed and the case will be heard July 31 so nobody knows whether this will come back or not and there may have to be another hearing. The next Edmonds School Board meeting is August 11; he suggested the Council meet with the School Board before the Council meeting.

**Scott Blomenkamp, Edmonds**, said the City Council has talked about having no resource and no options other than whether to sign the ILA. He pointed out every permit has the option for a miscellaneous review in accordance with ECDC 20.100.040 and the review could be related to hazards. The Mayor could ask the Community Services Director or the Council could vote on the application for a hearing review over whether the permitted activity is a hazard. It would be reasonable to say using hazardous material as an infill is a hazard. He suggested if a resident could find 3 residents within 300 feet of the fields they could apply themselves and he offered to assist them.

**Bruce Witenberg, Edmonds**, referred to the big picture related to the ILA. The Council has not publicly discussed many of the consequences of not approving the ILA. The planning process for the Woodway fields has been an ongoing partnership with the ESD since 2001; it has been conducted with extensive opportunity for citizen involvement. The playfields have been incorporated into various planning documents, all of which had public hearings. Historically Edmonds has had a very good relationship with the ESD and has partnered on various ventures. The City uses ESD's Meadowdale playfield and has an agreement to use the grass fields at Madrona K-8 which ends in the coming year and the City leases civic playfields, also a grass field, from ESD for \$1/year and is currently negotiating the purchase. Nothing the Council does with the ILA will prevent ESD from installing crumb rubber at the Woodway playfields and the ESD has indicated they will proceed with or without the City. A refusal to negotiate the ILA is nothing more than a short-sighted symbolic act that has the potential to undue much of the goodwill the City has with the ESD and jeopardize the City's use of other district-owned fields.

Mr. Witenberg explained the downside to the citizens of Edmonds of not approving the ILA is the City loses the opportunity to schedule the Woodway playfield, loses the revenue the ILA would provide, requires the City pay for use of the fields which would not be required if the ILA is approved, jeopardizes future use of Meadowdale and Madrona K-8 fields, loses credibility with long-time partner and most importantly could jeopardize negotiations for the purchase of the civic playfields. The ESD is not obligated to sell the civic playfield to the City. Without the ability to use or own civic playfield, the City would lose the natural turf soccer and baseball fields, the Boys & Girls Club, the tennis courts, the skate park and the venue for many of the City's signature events such as the 4<sup>th</sup> of July fireworks and Taste of Edmonds. He urged the Council not to take this symbolic action; it will not advance the position of those who are opposed to it.

Mayor Earling closed the public hearing at 9:21 p.m. and declared a brief recess.

## 7. AUDIENCE COMMENTS

**Alvin Rutledge, Edmonds**, commented there are many events this summer in Edmonds and other communities. He urged citizens to support the Edmonds community by attending the Taste of Edmonds on August 13-15 and the Car Show sponsored by the Chamber on September 12.

**Scott Blomenkamp, Edmonds**, said his earlier point regarding the Woodway fields was that there had only been one decision process regarding the fields, the ESD's decision, and they have a vested interest in how they make that decision. Mayor Earling advised Audience Comments must be regarding matters not listed on the agenda as a public hearing. Mr. Blomenkamp said the City Council has an opportunity to affect any permitted action under the ECDC by filing a miscellaneous review which puts any permit in front of third party that does not have a vested interest rather than having a decision made by one entity. The Mayor has that opportunity via the Community Services Director and the Council has the opportunity via a motion in accordance with ECDC 20.100.040.

**8. DISCUSSION AND POTENTIAL ACTION ON AN ORDINANCE AMENDING THE 2015 BUDGET**

Finance Director Scott James displayed and reviewed the following graphs comparing the first 6 months of 2014 to the first 6 months 2015:

- Property Tax Revenues – regular property tax, EMS levy and bond levy
  - Trending approximately \$288,000 higher in 2015
- Change in Sale Tax Revenue
  - Trending \$328,000 higher in 2015
- Development Related Revenue (permits and fees)
  - Trending approximately \$61,000 higher in 2015
- REET I & II Revenues
  - Trending approximately \$228,000 higher in 2015

Mr. James advised further mid-year financial information will be shared at the August 4 Council meeting. He provided an overview of the second quarter budget amendment:

- 17 decision packages
- 20,740,472 in new revenue to pay towards \$2,324,684 in new expenditures.
- Change in fund balance: \$18,415,788 increase

He reviewed new items for Council consideration

- Human Resources stay at work (SAW) light duty work program provides partial reimbursements for L&I. Funds will be used for accident prevention training.
- Increasing City Clerk Salaries and Benefits to provide temporary help to over the Deputy Clerk's medical leave
- Addition of staff member due to construction and building permit activity that has far exceeded projections.
  - Graph of building activity and staffing
- Mandated PERS contribution for temporary employee
- Consultant (Fitch & Associates) to assist with contract negotiations with Fire District 1
- Police Department retirement payout
- Additional compensation as a result of Edmonds Police Department Association contract, the correct calculation of Association's medical contribution, and correction in L& I rates
- Donations totaling \$8,000 toward installation of four wayfinding signs
- One percent for Arts transfer from City Park spray pad project
- Transfer of fund to complete design contract tasks that are part of the 2015 Waterline Replacement Project

- Complete two energy efficiency measures at the treatment plant using the Energy Savings Performance Contracting (ESCO) process
- Increased revenue due to CIP reprioritization of K-Turbo replacement

Mr. James reviewed items previously discussed by Council:

- 125<sup>th</sup> Anniversary celebration
- YMCA operation of Yost Pool and concession revenue
- \$500,000 in State funding to complete the analysis of the Edmonds waterfront at-grade train crossing alternatives
- SR99 Lighting Phase 3
- Establish budget appropriation for the 2015 revenue bonds that were issued in June

Mr. James displayed Exhibit A: Summary of beginning fund balance, revenue, expenses and ending fund balance; Exhibit B: Revenues; and Exhibit C: Expenditures.

Council President Fraley-Monillas clarified the intent was to discuss the proposed amendment tonight and schedule it for approval on next week's Consent Agenda.

Councilmember Petso referred to the new hire on the second floor which is identified as a one-time expenditure. As typically the City does not hire someone and immediately terminate them, she asked whether this was actual an ongoing expenditure. Mr. James explained the department anticipates submitting a request in 2016 budget. Councilmember Petso observed the position will be funded with permit revenues; she asked if this would be a temporary position until the level of permit activity changes. Development Services Director Shane Hope said it would be a temporary position; staff will include a permanent position as a decision package in the 2016 budget.

Councilmember Petso asked about the ESCO project at the treatment plant. Mr. Williams explained this project was previously discussed with the Council. The amendment is to recognize revenues and expenses. Another ESCO project will follow but has yet not been presented to the Council for decision. Councilmember Petso asked why the funds were not authorized last year. Mr. Williams said the funds were not received in 2014.

Councilmember Bloom referred to the amendment to increase City Clerk Salaries and asked what benefits will be paid for the two months position. Mr. James answered this former employee, who has previously done temporary work for the City, will receive a PERS contribution. Councilmember Bloom asked the number of hours for the temporary position. Mr. James said it is full-time for approximately seven weeks.

It was the consensus of the Council to schedule this on next week's Consent Agenda.

## **9. ADOPTION OF 2015 COMPREHENSIVE PLAN**

Mayor Earling suggested the Council consider how many of the remaining agenda items could be accomplished tonight. He advised that Ms. Hope will be gone next week.

**COUNCILMEMBER PETSO MOVED, SECONDED BY COUNCILMEMBER BLOOM TO DEFER ITEM 9 TO A LATER MEETING.**

As the City was already late in the adoption of the Comprehensive Plan update and recognizing Ms. Hope would be gone next week, Mayor Earling asked whether the proposed delay was workable. Ms. Hope answered it is not ideal; the City will be out of compliance for a longer period of time but if that is the desire of the Council, it can be done.



Councilmember Buckshnis did not support delaying approval, finding the Council has reviewed the Comprehensive Plan enough and has asked enough question and any additional questions can be get answered tonight.

**UPON ROLL CALL, MOTION ENDED IN A TIE (3-3-1); COUNCILMEMBERS BLOOM, JOHNSON AND PETSO VOTING YES; COUNCILMEMBER BUCKSHNIS, MESAROS AND NELSON VOTING NO; AND COUNCIL PRESIDENT FRALEY-MONILLAS ABSTAINING.**

Mr. Taraday advised Mayor Earling could break the tie.

**MAYOR EARLING VOTED NO, AND THE MOTION FAILED.**

Development Services Director Shane Hope briefly reviewed the schedule for the 2015 Comprehensive Plan update. The public process has included

- 32 public meetings
- 10 public hearings
- 2 house events
- Many other efforts & opportunities for input

She relayed the Planning Board's recommendation for the Council to adopt the 2015 Comprehensive Plan update. She reviewed the 2015 Comprehensive Plan contents:

- Introduction
  - Purpose & Scope
  - State & Regional Context
  - General Background
- Elements
  - Sustainability
  - Land Use
  - Housing
  - Economic Development
  - Culture & Urban Design
  - Utilities
  - Capital Facilities
  - Transportation
  - Parks Recreation & Open
  - Space (2014)
  - Community Culture Plan (2014)
- Appendices
  - Streetscape Plan (2006)
  - Street Tree Plan (2015) including minor updates to tree species list
    - Several poor-performing species were removed from list & replaced with other species (as discussed by Planning Board, Tree Board, et. al.)

At the July 7 meeting, Council reviewed and discussed revisions since June 23 meeting, asked questions about additional items, and made comments on update process and content. She reviewed issues from July 7 Council meeting:

- Council
  - Comprehensive Plan map inconsistency
  - Questions on Shoreline designation regarding residential
  - Whether proposed SMP consistent with Comprehensive Plan land Use Element
- Other
  - Letter from Puget Sound Regional Council (PSRC)

- Kudos
  1. Thorough review, update & streamlining of Comp Plan
  2. Focus on designated local centers
  3. Transportation Element with comprehensive & prioritized project list (including funding)
  4. Strong Housing Element
  5. Strong Sustainability Element
- Room for improvement
  1. More explanation about consistency with VISION 2040
  2. Implementation of LOS for pedestrian, bicycle & transit networks
  3. More explanation about Growing Transit Communities partnership
    - General statement
    - Consideration to amend housing goals to encourage affordable housing near key transit locations

She reviewed revisions since July 7 meeting:

1. Comp Plan Map corrected to include two Westgate properties – Plan pg. 36
2. Text added to Introduction Section to reflect comments from PSRC:
  - New subsection on “Growing Transit Communities” partnership – Plan pg. 7
  - Additional language about Comp Plan’s relationship to VISION 2040 – Plan pg. 7

Follow-up on Street Tree Plan:

- Does City Council want to stick with Street Tree Plan as revised OR
  - Reviewed by Planning Board, Tree Board, & staff
  - Recognizing that next year is planned for broader review of Street Tree Plan
- Use alternate Street Tree Plan with recent suggestions to remove several tree species, add several tree species, and clarify planting instructions
  - May be more appropriate to make these changes next year

Why take action now:

- State law says Comp Plan updates due June 30, 2015
  - Comp Plan already slightly past deadline
- City officials obligated to follow state laws
- City not eligible for many types of grants without GMA compliance
- Comp Plan update represents quality work + public input + significant Council direction
- Many other things to do...

Ms. Hope identified next steps following adoption:

- State and PSRC will be sent final document
- City will be eligible for state/federal grants
- Clean final document with all parts will be posted online
- Hard copy of entire plan in one document will be prepared for Councilmembers who want it
- Implementation of Plan will be carried out over time
- City can move on to other projects

Councilmember Petso referred to her email to Ms. Hope regarding language included at the request of the Growing Transit Communities group. She has been attending their meetings remotely and the discussion regarding transit oriented development has dealt only with light rail stations which Edmonds does not have. She suggested changing “transit oriented development in key locations” to “planning to accommodate growth in areas well served by transit.” Ms. Hope said the language suggested by Councilmember Petso was not bad but it misses the point about transit oriented development which is not

just growth where transit occurs but development that works well with transit stations She felt “transit oriented development” was a better term to use. She said the Growing Transit Communities project began with light rail stations and the areas around them but has expanded to include other types of stations such as Swift stations on Highway 99.

Councilmember Petso said that has not come up in the meetings she has attended. She asked whether transit oriented development was defined in the Comprehensive Plan. Ms. Hope was not certain if a definition was included in the Comprehensive Plan. The definition used by PSRC is, “The development of housing, commercial space, services and job opportunities in close proximity to public transportation. Such development is intended to reduce dependency on automobiles as well as improve mobility and access between residences, jobs and services.” Councilmember Petso said that sounds similar to the wording she suggested.

Councilmember Petso referred to a reference to Edmonds Conference Center on page 42 and asked whether that should be deleted based on recent events. Ms. Hope answered it did not really matter; it could be left in or not. The Comprehensive Plan is not up-to-date every minute, it is accurate at the time it is developed and can be amended next year.

Councilmember Petso said the number of residential units the City is expecting to add seems to have changed from the lower number generated by 2012 Buildable Lands Report to a higher number. Ms. Hope explained the 2012 Buildable Lands Report, developed in 2011, identified capacity for a lower number than after further research into the methodology and current zoning. That newer number reflects the countywide planning and targets adopted in the Countywide Planning Policies via the Snohomish County Tomorrow process.. Councilmember Petso asked if the newer number also reflected land use changes made in Westgate and on Highway 99. Ms. Hope answered the zoning as is and before the Westgate Plan accommodates the projected growth over a 20 year period.

**COUNCILMEMBER MESAROS MOVED, SECONDED BY COUNCILMEMBER BUCKSHNIS, TO EXTEND THE MEETING UNTIL 10:20 P.M. UPON ROLL CALL, MOTION CARRIED (5-2); COUNCIL PRESIDENT FRALEY-MONILLAS AND COUNCILMEMBERS BUCKSHNIS, JOHNSON, MESAROS, AND NELSON VOTING YES; AND COUNCILMEMBERS BLOOM AND PETSO VOTING NO.**

Councilmember Bloom referred to page 51, short term actions related to the Edmonds Crossing project #1, “Develop a short term plan and strategy to address transportation conflicts and safety issues involving the interaction of rail, ferry, vehicular and pedestrian traffic in the waterfront area.” She said this is related to the alternative study and she preferred to revert back to the language approved by Council as reflected in the December 17, 2013 meeting minutes where the Council prioritized 4 items and the language above was changed by unanimous vote to “alternatives analysis to study waterfront access issues, emphasizing and prioritizing near term solutions to providing emergency access.”

**COUNCILMEMBER BLOOM MOVED, SECONDED BY COUNCILMEMBER PETSO, REVISE #1 ON PAGE 51 OF THE COMPREHENSIVE PLAN TO READ, “DEVELOP A SHORT TERM PLAN AND STRATEGY EMPHASIZING AND PRIORITIZING NEAR TERM SOLUTIONS TO PROVIDING EMERGENCY ACCESS TO ADDRESS TRANSPORTATION CONFLICTS AND SAFETY ISSUES INVOLVING THE INTERACTION OF RAIL, FERRY, VEHICULAR AND PEDESTRIAN TRAFFIC IN THE WATERFRONT.”**

Councilmember Bloom said this makes sense because it addresses a short term plan and strategy to address transportation conflicts; the long term plan is Edmonds Crossing which will not happen for many years. She planned to make the same motion for the TIP.

Council President Fraley-Monillas asked if emergency access was addressed in the Comprehensive Plan. Ms. Hope answered yes, it may be in the Transportation Plan although she was uncertain it was identified as a priority.

Councilmember Petso asked where the reference to emergency access is in the Comprehensive Plan. Ms. Hope offered to search for it.

Councilmember Bloom explained this is the fourth year the alternatives study to resolve conflicts at Dayton and Main has been addressed by the Council. From the beginning, she requested emergency vehicle and pedestrian access over the waterfront be prioritized over addressing the ferry problems and the at-grade crossing issues. To her that was the most important thing and was what was needed sooner rather than later. She read from the Comprehensive Plan, "Short term actions are those actions that can take place prior to construction of the Edmonds Crossing project." She said few would believe that a tunnel or a trench is a short term action; the shortest term action would be resolving emergency vehicle and pedestrian access over the waterfront. Prioritizing that makes perfect sense as it did when the Council voted unanimously in 2013 to prioritize it.

Councilmember Petso said she located reference to emergency access in the Transportation Element on page 3-95; it does not indicate any priority on emergency access. She read the reference, "*Railroad use for freight transport has greatly increased and is expected to increase even more in the future. The frequency and greater length of trains means that access between the west side and east side of the rail is blocked for longer periods of time. This has significant implications for people needing to access either side—whether for emergency, business, residential, recreational, or other needs.*"

*A priority of the city has been to find a solution to the at-grade railroad crossings at Main and Dayton Streets to the waterfront. The need is evident for providing emergency access, pedestrian/bicycle access, and access to the ferry and other land uses. Various options have been discussed, each with certain advantages, disadvantages, and costs. To determine the best option(s), the city has secured funds as part of the 2015 Legislative transportation package."*

Council President Fraley-Monillas asked if prioritization of emergency access could be added to the Transportation Element. Ms. Hope answered yes.

Mayor Earling recalled conversations with Mr. Clifton and Mr. Williams regarding making that a priority. The alternatives analysis will consider a number of options; it is anticipated to take 14-18 months. He recognized even items that are identified as short time will take years to accumulate the funds to move projects forward. Public Works Director Phil Williams agreed with Mayor Earling's statement, noting long versus short term depends on how long long-term is. He noted 14-18 months is not a short period of time but in the overall scheme of things for a project like Edmonds Crossing, everything else will look shorter term. At the meeting whether the language Councilmember Bloom referred to was approved, he recalled there were four bullets that addressed the provision of emergency response services to the other side of the tracks. The intent is to be faithful to that direction and he suggested incorporating the full text from the motion as there were other items in addition to provision of emergency service.

Councilmember Bloom relayed her understanding of Mr. Williams's explanation that all four bullet points be incorporated; the first bullet point read exactly as her motion states. Mr. Williams recalled there were other bullets in the motion which began to articulate a basic scope for the alternatives analysis. If the intent is to include language in the Comprehensive Plan that is consistent with the Council's prior action, all four bullet points should be included.

Councilmember Bloom said she intend to make an amendment to the TIP to prioritize emergency access in alternatives study; she suggested adding the four bullet points to the TIP and only add the phrase in her

motion to the Comprehensive Plan. Mr. Williams suggested including all four bullet points in the Comprehensive Plan and the TIP. That was acceptable to Ms. Hope.

**COUNCILMEMBER BLOOM WITHDREW THE MOTION WITH THE AGREEMENT OF THE SECOND.**

**COUNCILMEMBER BLOOM MOVED, SECONDED BY COUNCILMEMBER PETSO, TO INCORPORATE THE FOUR POINTS FROM THE LANGUAGE IN THE DECEMBER 17, 2013 COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES ON PAGE 16. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

**COUNCILMEMBER BUCKSHNIS MOVED, SECONDED BY COUNCIL PRESIDENT FRALEY-MONILLAS, TO RETAIN ATTACHMENT 9, THE ORIGINAL STREET TREE PLAN.**

Councilmember Buckshnis preferred to adopt the existing Street Tree Plan to allow further review by the Tree Board and Planning Board and include it in next year's Comprehensive Plan update.

**MOTION CARRIED (6-0-1), COUNCILMEMBER BLOOM ABSTAINED.**

**COUNCILMEMBER PETSO MOVED, SECONDED BY COUNCILMEMBER BLOOM, TO REPLACE THE LANGUAGE ON PAGE 7, "THROUGH ITS PLANNING FOR TRANSIT-ORIENTED DEVELOPMENT IN KEY LOCATIONS" WITH "BY PLANNING TO ACCOMMODATE GROWTH IN AREAS WELL SERVED BY TRANSIT."**

Councilmember Johnson said transit oriented development is a word of art and changing the language would be inconsistent with the county's regional plans.

Council President Fraley-Monillas did not support the motion; she preferred transit oriented development as it is more explanatory.

Councilmember Petso agreed transit oriented development is a term of art and her wish was for this to be the City's Comprehensive Plan and encompass the broader policy of planning to accommodate growth in areas well served by transit. In the Growing Transit Communities meeting she has attended, they are looking at this form of development for areas around light rail stations. Edmonds does not have a light rail station but it does have areas well served by transit such as Swift stations.

Councilmember Johnson said she has also been attending the Growing Transit Communities meetings; Councilmember Petso is correct the discussions to date have been regarding light rail stations, however, Edmonds is a member of the group and they will be discussing issues related to transit oriented development around the Swift station and corridors with high transit. It is pertinent to Edmonds particularly along the SR99 and SR104 corridors and the heavy rail station on the waterfront.

**COUNCIL PRESIDENT FRALEY-MONILLAS CALLED FOR THE QUESTION. COUNCILMEMBER BUCKSHNIS SECONDED. UPON ROLL CALL, THE VOTE ON THE CALL FOR THE QUESTION CARRIED (5-2); COUNCIL PRESIDENT FRALEY-MONILLAS AND COUNCILMEMBERS BUCKSHNIS, JOHNSON, MESAROS AND NELSON VOTING YES; AND COUNCILMEMBERS BLOOM AND PETSO VOTING NO.**

**MAIN MOTION FAILED (2-5), COUNCILMEMBERS PETSO AND BLOOM VOTING YES.**

**COUNCILMEMBER MESAROS MOVED, SECONDED BY COUNCILMEMBER BUCKSHNIS, TO EXTEND FOR 15 MINUTES. UPON ROLL CALL, MOTION FAILED (4-3) FOR LACK OF A SUPER MAJORITY; COUNCIL PRESIDENT FRALEY-MONILLAS AND COUNCILMEMBERS BUCKSHNIS, MESAROS AND NELSON VOTING YES; AND COUNCILMEMBERS BLOOM, JOHNSON AND PETSO VOTING NO.**

10. **RESOLUTION ADOPTING THE 2016-2021 SIX-YEAR TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM**
11. **ORDINANCE AMENDING THE EDMONDS CITY CODE PROVISIONS RELATING TO COUNCIL COMMITTEE MEETINGS**
12. **MAYOR'S COMMENTS**
13. **COUNCIL COMMENTS**
14. **CONVENE IN EXECUTIVE SESSION REGARDING PENDING OR POTENTIAL LITIGATION PER RCW 42.30.110(1)(i)**
15. **RECONVENE IN OPEN SESSION. POTENTIAL ACTION AS A RESULT OF MEETING IN EXECUTIVE SESSION**
16. **ADJOURN**

The Council meeting was adjourned at 10:30 p.m.